

Spring 2004

Review of 'The Owl, the Raven, and the Dove: The Religious Meaning of the Grimms' Magic Fairy Tales,' by G. Ronald Murphy, S.J."

Evelyn M. Perry

Framingham State University, eperry@framingham.edu

Follow this and additional works at: http://digitalcommons.framingham.edu/eng_facpub



Part of the [English Language and Literature Commons](#)

Citation

Perry, Evelyn M.. "Review of 'The Owl, the Raven, and the Dove: The Religious Meaning of the Grimms' Magic Fairy Tales,' by G. Ronald Murphy, S.J.:" *Journal of American Folklore* 117, no. 464 (2004): 235-236. Accessed at http://digitalcommons.framingham.edu/eng_facpub/49

This Book Review is brought to you for free and open access by the English Department at Digital Commons at Framingham State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in English Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons at Framingham State University. For more information, please contact vgonzalez@framingham.edu.

Despite the emphasis on historical continuity, some of the most interesting pieces here look at how women have adapted traditions to fit modern life. Cantú describes the recently created *cincuentañera*, a new rite of passage created by fifty-year-old women using elements of the traditional *quinceañera*, a fifteen-year-old girls' coming-of-age party. Helen R. Lucero surveys the work of female artists who create *retablos* (painted wood panels) and *santos* (saints), both of which are typically produced by men. Domino Renee Pérez offers traditional and contemporary versions of *La Llorona*, asserting that modern-day Chicanas are reinterpreting the story to make her "a representation of female resistance within a wholly oppressive environment" and to "address [the] new struggles" women face in contemporary urban life (p. 110).

Part 2, "Practicing Traditions," consists of intimate portraits of three extraordinary women and their individual expressions of Chicana folklore. Yolanda Broyles-González's account of her Yaqui grandmother's philosophy and practice of an "Indianized" Catholicism is singularly moving. Cynthia L. Vidaurri's look at the women of the *Fidencistas*, a folk religious movement based on the life and work of "El Niño Fidencio" (a *curandero* in early twentieth-century Nuevo León), examines ways in which Chicana healers have challenged male authority in non-radical, "culturally appropriate" ways (p. 141). Leonor Xóchitl Pérez provides a very personal account of the trials faced by women who wish to be mariachis and the empowering possibilities offered by participation in this traditionally masculine musical genre.

The final section of the book, "Transforming Traditions," is devoted to analyses of ways in which women have altered and transcended traditional Mexicano/Chicano culture, often inventing new forms of expression along the way. Broyles-González contributes a piece on Lydia Mendoza's *ranchera* songs, examining her unique contributions to the genre and to the Chicano community as a whole as she "deterritorialized 'Mexicanness'" (p. 198) and created a diasporic community through the "powerful mythic space" of *el rancho* (p. 188). This author so excels at describing the nonverbal that one hopes she will someday tackle other long-neglected genres such as dance. An infor-

mative study by Nájera-Ramírez on the newly created women's equestrian tradition, *la escaramuza charra*, provides a fascinating discussion of how some women have succeeded, with difficulty, in overcoming gender-prescribed boundaries by using the "cultural logic" (p. 220) of the tradition against itself. Deborah Vargas examines the politics of musical crossover through the career of Tejana singer Selena, convincingly arguing that the very concept of "crossover," which implies a linear progression toward North American "success," is problematic for the description of Selena's "crossover" into the Latin American market from her regional Tejano base. The collection concludes with Tey Marianna Nunn's description of the work of Albuquerque artist Goldie Garcia and her use of *rasquache*, a flashy and uniquely Chicana/o aesthetic based on pastiche.

Although a few of the essays here would have benefited from greater attention to specific performers and performances, and others try too hard to find feminist meaning in the most tenuous places, most were effective in offering new perspectives on Chicana folklore. The most successful pieces were those that examined the specifics of particular works, communities, or individuals. *Chicana Traditions* provides an informative look at women's contributions to well-known but traditionally masculine genres such as mariachi music and santos carving, and it is a useful introduction to less familiar traditions that have for too long been ignored or overlooked. Through it, the editors have accomplished their goal of making this scholarship available to a wider audience and will certainly inspire other researchers to follow in their footsteps.

The Owl, the Raven, and the Dove: The Religious Meaning of the Grimms' Magic Fairy Tales. By G. Ronald Murphy, S.J. (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002. Pp. xi+183, bibliography, illustrations, appendices.)

EVELYN M. PERRY
Framingham State College

Once upon a cocktail party in Rochester, New York, I had the pleasure of meeting Dr. Stephen Knight of the University of Wales. Because it

was shortly after the publication of his study on the legend of Robin Hood, our conversation naturally turned in that direction. He told me that the subtitle of his text, *A Complete Study of the English Outlaw*, was chosen by the publisher and that he was somewhat mortified that such a claim should have been made in his name. Perhaps the same may be said of G. Ronald Murphy's *The Owl, the Raven, and the Dove: The Religious Meaning of the Grimms' Magic Fairy Tales*, because the text's subtitle is both misleading and limiting. Murphy's scholarship is all embracing and rigorous. His examination includes the insights of fairy tale scholars and does not disprove alternate readings of the Grimms' work in order to support his own claims; nor is his study directed only at religious symbolism and sentiment in the fairy tales of the Brothers Grimm. Rather, Murphy uses contributions to fairy tale studies as a support for his comprehensive, well-argued, and painstakingly researched analysis.

Murphy's descriptions of Wilhelm and Jacob Grimms' biographies, their familiarity with the stories of classical antiquity, their appreciation for Germanic tales as cultural archives, and their profound Christian beliefs, strengthen his ultimate claim: the Grimms, Wilhelm in particular, reworked the fairy tales throughout their lives in order to do them literary, cultural, and Christian moral justice. In chapter 1, "The Roots of Spiritual Stories," Murphy outlines the lives and life works of Jacob and Wilhelm Grimm and argues convincingly that they did not just record their tales, but that they lovingly refashioned them in order to highlight and celebrate their literary, cultural, and Christian elements. Thus, the Grimms were retellers, shaping fairy tales as they saw fit, with great acumen, admirable talent, and according to their academic and personal interests—an approach often celebrated in the works of contemporary retellers such as Anita Diamant, C. S. Lewis, and Gregory Maguire.

Chapter 2, "Scholars and the Religious Spirit of the Tales," provides an overview of significant contributions to fairy tale studies and to Murphy's analysis in particular; he pays special attention to Bruno Bettelheim, Heinz Rölleke, and Ruth Bottigheimer (but does not mention Jack Zipes, Maria Tatar, or Marie-Louise Von Franz). In chapter 3, "The Spiritu-

ality of Wilhelm Grimm," Murphy describes his research into the Grimms' original and reworked manuscripts and illustrates the particular abilities and approaches of Wilhelm Grimm, the chief reteller.

In the remainder of the book, Murphy notes Wilhelm Grimm's repeated use of symbols—the owl (describing his attention to the threads of classical antiquity), the raven (demonstrating his attention to the threads of German *Märchen*), and the dove (exemplifying his faithful Christian morality). Murphy examines these symbols in five of the Grimms' best-known and much-loved fairy tales: "Hansel and Gretel," "Little Red Riding Hood," "Cinderella," "Snow White," and "Sleeping Beauty." Throughout, he is careful and respectful in his discussion of alternate versions of the tales, especially those written by Charles Perrault and Giambattista Basile, which, he asserts, informed the work of the Brothers Grimm.

Though rare, there are moments of analysis in this book that require a leap of faith (for example, the prophetic frog in "Sleeping Beauty" is actually the prince who awakens the sleeping damsel). But here the reader is both assured and reassured; we are assured that Wilhelm Grimm himself took a leap of faith when reworking the tales and highlighting their particular literary, cultural, and Christian elements, and we are reassured by Murphy's outstanding scholarship. His text is lively, careful, insightful, thoughtful, and provocative—a significant contribution to fairy tale studies.

Gesture, Gender, Nation: Dance and Social Change in Uzbekistan. By Mary Masayo Doi. (Westport, Conn.: Bergin & Garvey, 2002. Pp. xii + 151, bibliography, photographs, index.)

SYDNEY HUTCHINSON
New York University

In *Gesture, Gender, Nation*, Mary Masayo Doi draws from classic anthropological literature, dance scholarship, and practice theory to explain the role of dance in the formation of a national identity in Uzbekistan from the early Soviet period through the present. She argues that Soviets used dance as a tool of social change, unifying the republic's diverse ethnic